

---

**SPECIAL JOINT MEETING OF THE POLICY COMMITTEES  
(COMMUNITY, ECONOMIC & HUMAN DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE;  
ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE; AND THE  
TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE OF THE  
SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
MARCH 24, 2016**

---

**THE FOLLOWING MINUTES ARE A SUMMARY OF ACTIONS AND/OR DISCUSSIONS THAT OCCURRED AT THE JOINT MEETING. A VIDEO RECORDING OF THE ACTUAL MEETING IS AVAILABLE AT <http://scag.ca.gov/NewsAndMedia/Pages/SCAGTV.aspx>**

A Joint Meeting of the Policy Committees of the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) was held at the SCAG Los Angeles Office. A quorum was present.

**TC Members – Present:**

Chair*	1.	Hon. Alan Wapner	<i>Ontario</i>	SANBAG
Vice-Chair *	2.	Hon. Barbara Messina	<i>Alhambra</i>	District 34
	* 3.	Hon. Sean Ashton	<i>Downey</i>	District 25
	* 4.	Hon. Glen Becerra	<i>Simi Valley</i>	District 46
	5.	Hon. Ben Benoit	<i>Wildomar</i>	WRCOG
	6.	Hon. Russell Betts	<i>Desert Hot Springs</i>	CVAG
	* 7.	Hon. Art Brown	<i>Buena Park</i>	District 21
	* 8.	Hon. Joe Buscaino	<i>Los Angeles</i>	District 62
	9.	Hon. Diana Lee Carey	<i>Westminster</i>	OCCOG
	* 10.	Hon. Jonathan Curtis	<i>La Cañada Flintridge</i>	District 36
	* 11.	Hon. Gene Daniels	<i>Paramount</i>	District 24
	* 12.	Hon. Paul Eaton	<i>Montclair</i>	District 9
	* 13.	Hon. Felipe Fuentes	<i>Los Angeles</i>	District 54
	* 14.	Hon. James Gazeley	<i>Lomita</i>	District 39
	* 15.	Hon. Carol Herrera	<i>Diamond Bar</i>	District 37
	* 16.	Hon. Steve Hofbauer	<i>Palmdale</i>	District 43
	* 17.	Hon. Jim Hyatt	<i>Calimesa</i>	District 3
	18.	Hon. Severo Lara	<i>Ojai</i>	VCOG
	* 19.	Hon. Clint Lorimore	<i>Eastvale</i>	District 4
	* 20.	Hon. Ray Marquez	<i>Chino Hills</i>	District 10
	* 21.	Hon. Michele Martinez	<i>Santa Ana</i>	District 16
	* 22.	Hon. Ryan McEachron	<i>Victorville</i>	SANBAG
	23.	Hon. Marsha McLean	<i>Santa Clarita</i>	North L.A. County
	* 24.	Hon. Dan Medina	<i>Gardena</i>	District 28

* 25.	Hon. Keith Millhouse	<i>Moorpark</i>	VCTC
26.	Hon. Carol Moore	<i>Laguna Woods</i>	OCCOG
* 27.	Hon. Kris Murray	<i>Anaheim</i>	District 19
* 28.	Hon. Frank Navarro	<i>Colton</i>	District 6
* 29.	Hon. Pam O’Connor	<i>Santa Monica</i>	District 41
30.	Hon. Micheál O’Leary	<i>Culver City</i>	WCCOG
* 31.	Hon. Sam Pedroza	<i>Claremont</i>	District 38
32.	Hon. Teresa Real Sebastian	<i>Monterey Park</i>	SGVCOG
33.	Hon. Dwight Robinson	<i>Lake Forest</i>	OCCOG
* 34.	Hon. Ali Saleh	<i>Bell</i>	District 27
* 35.	Hon. Karen Spiegel	<i>Corona</i>	District 63
* 36.	Hon. Michelle Steel		Orange County
37.	Hon. Cynthia Sternquist	<i>Temple City</i>	SGVCOG
* 38.	Hon. Jess Talamantes	<i>Burbank</i>	District 42
* 39.	Hon. Cheryl Viegas-Walker	<i>El Centro</i>	District 1

**CEHD Members – Present:**

Chair*	1.	Hon. Bill Jahn	<i>Big Bear Lake</i>	District 11
Vice-Chair*	2.	Hon. Larry McCallon	<i>Highland</i>	District 7
	3.	Hon. Al Austin	<i>Long Beach</i>	GCCOG
	4.	Hon. Stacy Berry	<i>Cypress</i>	OCCOG
	5.	Hon. Carol Chen	<i>Cerritos</i>	GCCOG
*	6.	Hon. Steven Choi	<i>Irvine</i>	District 14
	7.	Hon. Jeffrey Cooper	<i>Culver City</i>	WSCCOG
*	8.	Hon. Margaret E. Finlay	<i>Duarte</i>	District 35
	9.	Hon. Debbie Franklin	<i>Banning</i>	WRCOG
	10.	Hon. Bob Joe	<i>South Pasadena</i>	Arroyo Verdugo Cities
*	11.	Hon. Barbara Kogerman	<i>Laguna Hills</i>	District 13
	12.	Hon. Paula Lantz	<i>Pomona</i>	SGVCOG
*	13.	Hon. Victor Manalo	<i>Artesia</i>	District 23
	14.	Hon. Joseph McKee	<i>Desert Hot Springs</i>	CVAG
	15.	Hon. Ray Musser	<i>Upland</i>	SANBAG
*	16.	Hon. Steve Nagel	<i>Fountain Valley</i>	District 15
*	17.	Hon. Erik Peterson	<i>Huntington Beach</i>	District 64
	18.	Hon. Jim Predmore	<i>Holtville</i>	ICTC
	19.	Hon. Sonny R. Santa Ines	<i>Bellflower</i>	GCCOG
	20.	Hon. Becky Shevlin	<i>Monrovia</i>	SGVCOG
	21.	Hon. Mark Waronek	<i>Lomita</i>	SBCCOG

**EEC Members – Present:**

Chair*	1.	Hon.	Deborah Robertson	<i>Rialto</i>	District 8
Vice-Chair*	2.	Hon.	Carmen Ramirez	<i>Oxnard</i>	District 45
	*	3.	Hon. Ross Chun	<i>Aliso Viejo</i>	TCA
	*	4.	Hon. Margaret Clark	<i>Rosemead</i>	District 32
	5.	Hon.	Larry Forester	<i>Signal Hill</i>	GCCOG
	6.	Hon.	Laura Friedman	<i>Glendale</i>	Arroyo Verdugo Cities
	7.	Hon.	Sandra Genis	<i>Costa Mesa</i>	OCCOG
	8.	Hon.	Diana Mahmud	<i>South Pasadena</i>	SGVCOG
	9.	Hon.	Thomas Martin	<i>Maywood</i>	GCCOG
	*	10.	Hon. Judy Mitchell	<i>Rolling Hills Estates</i>	District 40
	*	11.	Hon. Mike Munzing	<i>Aliso Viejo</i>	District 12
	12.	Hon.	Jim Osborne	<i>Lawndale</i>	SBCCOG
	13.	Hon.	David Pollock	<i>Moorpark</i>	VCOG
	14.	Hon.	Meghan Sahli-Wells	<i>Culver City</i>	WCCOG
	15.	Hon.	Betty Sanchez	<i>Coachella</i>	CVAG
	16.	Mr.	Steve Schuyler	<i>Building Industry Association of Southern California (BIASC)</i>	
	*	17.	Hon. John Sibert	<i>Malibu</i>	District 44
	18.	Hon.	Diane Williams	<i>Rancho Cucamonga</i>	SANBAG
	19.	Hon.	Edward Wilson	<i>Signal Hill</i>	GCCOG

\*Regional Councilmember

**Staff Present**

Hasan Ikhata, Executive Director  
 Debbie Dillon, Deputy Executive Director, Administration  
 Darin Chidsey, Director, Strategy, Policy and Public Affairs  
 Huasha Liu, Director, Land Use and Environmental Planning  
 Naresh Amatya, Acting Director, Transportation Planning  
 Basil Panas, Chief Financial Officer  
 Joe Silvey, General Counsel  
 Joann Africa, Chief Counsel/Director, Legal Services  
 Tess Rey-Chaput, Office of Regional Council Support

## **CALL TO ORDER AND PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

President Cheryl Viegas-Walker, El Centro, District 1, called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m. and asked Councilmember Larry McCallon, Highland, District 7, to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

Transportation Committee (TC) Chair Alan Wapner, SANBAG, provided an introduction to the Action/Discussion Items of the Special Joint Meeting of the Policy Committees. He reminded the members that developing the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS (also referred to as the “Plan”) is a fluid process and that future amendments and revisions to the document may be made and emphasized the importance of its approval and the certification of the accompanying Proposed Final Program Environmental Impact Report (also referred to as the “Proposed Final PEIR” and the “PEIR”).

## **PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

Chair Alan Wapner announced that Public Comments related to Agenda Item Nos. 1 and 2 would be entertained after the items were presented.

## **ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS**

TC Chair Wapner asked Community, Economic and Human Development (CEHD) Committee Chair Bill Jahn and Energy and Environment Committee (EEC) Chair Deborah Robertson to provide remarks.

CEHD Chair Bill Jahn thanked the CEHD Committee members for their efforts to provide SCAG staff with guidance and direction in the development and preparation of the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS that would lead the region to improve sustainability and maximize the efficiency of transportation investments. He urged the members to support the actions as proposed to move the Plan forward.

EEC Chair Deborah Robertson echoed the comments made by CEHD Chair Bill Jahn and stated that the five (5) major components of the Proposed Final PEIR comply with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requirements. Similarly, she urged the members to support the actions as proposed to move the Plan forward.

## **CONSENT CALENDAR**

### **3. Joint Meeting Minutes of the Regional Council and Policy Committees, March 3, 2016**

A MOTION was made (Jahn) to approve Agenda Item No. 3. Motion was SECONDED (Finlay) and passed by the following votes:

**AYES:** Benoit, Betts, Carey, Chen,\* Chun, Clark, Cooper, Curtis, Daniels, Eaton, Finlay, Forester, Friedman, Fuentes, Gazeley, Genis, Herrera, Hofbauer, Hyatt, Jahn, Joe, Lantz, Lorimore, Manalo, Marquez, M. Martinez, Martin, McCallon, McEachron, McKee, McLean, Medina, Messina, Millhouse, Mitchell, Musser, Nagel, Navarro, O’Leary, Osborne, Peterson, Pollock, Predmore, Real Sebastian, Ramirez, Robertson, Sahli-Wells, Saleh, Sanchez, Santa Ines, Shevlin, Spiegel, Steel, Sternquist, Talamantes, Viegas-Walker, Wapner, Waronek and Williams (59).

**NOES:** None (0).

**ABSTAIN:** Berry, Franklin and Robinson (3).

Councilmember Carol Chen, Cerritos, GCCOG, indicated that she intended to vote “Yes” on this item; however, inadvertently voted “No” on her electronic device. General Counsel, Joe Silvey, directed staff to record Councilmember Carol Chen’s “Yes” vote and is annotated\* above.

### **ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS**

#### **1. Proposed Final 2016-2040 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (2016 RTP/SCS)**

Chair Wapner asked Naresh Amatya, Acting Director, Transportation Planning, and Huasha Liu, Director, Land Use and Environmental Planning, to provide background information.

Mr. Amatya reported that the public comments received at the March 3, 2016 meeting were used during the updating of the Plan. He discussed the significant updates made to the Plan; the Plan’s core components and the comments/response summary; the Plan’s outcomes and benefits; the schedule timeline; and recommended action. Mr. Amatya indicated that the Plan meets state and federal requirements and will help the region achieve improved mobility, accessibility and sustainability. In looking ahead beyond the adoption of the Plan, Mr. Amatya discussed moving forward with transportation priorities and maximizing the value of the investments to be made in the SCAG Region. Huasha Liu, Director, Land Use and Environmental Planning, discussed building a shared vision in the areas of sustainability, housing, demographics, and GIS services/data modeling; and tracking our progress in air quality and performance monitoring.

TC Member Russell Betts, Desert Hot Springs, asked for clarification regarding a statement referenced on page 168 of the agenda packet with respect to the Mileage Based User Fee program that does not assume revenues before 2025. TC Chair Alan Wapner responded that when calculations were made regarding the financing of the proposed projects, there was an assumption that the Mileage Based User Fee concept would not be implemented prior to 2025 such that only projects to be implemented after 2025 would receive funding from Mileage Based User Fees.

CEHD Member Joseph McKee, Desert Hot Springs, asked a question with respect to the energy cost-savings and where those savings would be coming from.

TC Member Marsha McLean, Santa Clarita, asked how to address transportation connectivity funding issues in the Plan relative to the outcome of Measure M that will go to the voters at the November 2016 ballot. TC Chair Wapner responded that any significant event that would affect certain components of the Plan would require amendments to the Plan for the Regional Council’s consideration.

CEHD Member Paula Lantz, Pomona, asked for clarification with respect to the relationship between the Plan and funding specifically on the investment component. Hasan Ikhrata, Executive Director, responded that the Plan, under the federal law, has to be financially-constrained and cited an example on transportation investments and sources of funding.

EEC Member David Pollock, Moorpark, asked a question regarding the date when the local revenue sources will be available, for example, with respect to the proposed half-cent sales tax for Ventura County. Mr. Ikhata responded that if the measure does not pass at the November election, an amendment will be made to the Plan.

EEC Member Larry Forester, Signal Hill, asked for clarification on page 167 of the agenda packet in reference to the 12% indicated as “Additional State” under the core components of the financial plan. Mr. Ikhata responded and cited an example that in 2006, the California voters passed the 1B bond [Highway Safety, Traffic Reduction, Air Quality and Port Security Bond Act of 2006] to fund transportation projects to relieve congestion, improve goods movement, improve air quality and enhance the safety and security of the transportation system.

### **PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

TC Chair Wapner opened the Public Comment period.

Greg Carpenter, City Manager, City of El Segundo, commented that the City of El Segundo continues to oppose the passenger demand forecasts associated with the Los Angeles International Airport and requested that the associated Proposed Final PEIR be revised and strongly urged the Regional Council to not approve the 2016 RTP/SCS.

Laurel Impett, Planner for Shute, Mihaly, Weinberger, stated that the 5-Cities Alliance, which is comprised of the cities of Glendale, La Cañada Flintridge, Sierra Madre, Pasadena and South Pasadena, submitted comments on the Proposed Final PEIR with respect to CEQA’s requirements. She stated that staff’s responses to the comments had failed to fully address the deficiencies and she cited as examples possible inconsistencies with State climate policy and a failure to properly address the SR-710 project in the health risk analysis.

Susan Durbin, Silverstein Law, representing the City of La Cañada Flintridge, commented on excluding the SR-710 North Extension from the project list and the 710 Tunnel alternative as it is incompatible with SB 375.

Harry Baldwin, commented that prior RTPs have included the SR-710 North Extension Project to alleviate air quality problems and relieve congestion issues. He encouraged the members to support the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS as he feels it meets state and federal requirements.

Katie Lemmon, Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Committee, expressed support for the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS and its shared vision for the region’s transportation future.

Leland Dolly, stated support for the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS and complimented Hasan Ikhata for his efforts.

Mary Cammarano, San Gabriel County Water District, complimented SCAG staff for the development of the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS and encouraged support for the SR-710 Extension to relieve congestion in the cities of San Gabriel and Alhambra.

On behalf of State Senator Ed Hernandez, Clayton Arick expressed support for the 710 Tunnel and the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS and urged adoption of the Plan.

Ignacio Muniz, Principal, Fremont Elementary, Alhambra Unified School District, expressed support for the 710 Extension to relieve congestion and improve air quality for the community.

On behalf of State Assembly Member Ed Chau, Henry Lo expressed support for the SR-710 Extension and 710 Tunnel to improve air quality, health risk issues and relieve traffic congestion.

Andy Rice, PhD, Researcher, UCLA, expressed concerns with respect to the inaccessible aggregated data of model scenario for GHGs in the region and suggested making the data available to the public. He expressed support for the Plan and encouraged increased transparency.

Miles Mitchell, City of Los Angeles, expressed support for the language recently added in the Plan with respect to the SCS consistency issue in reference to Chapter IV, page 70 of the SCS. He stated that the purpose of the paragraph is “to facilitate and protect access to grant funding by local cities.” He stated that the added paragraph included two (2) basic concepts: first, for purposes of qualifying for future funding opportunities and/or other incentive programs sub-jurisdictional data used to determine consistency with the SCS shall only be used and at the discretion and approval of the local jurisdiction; second, the use of the data by public agencies for transportation modelling and planning purposes is not limited. He stated that the insertion of this language balances the goal of local control in the grant funding process. He thanked SCAG staff and complimented the level of collaboration.

Melanie Schlotterbeck, Friends of Harbor, Beaches and Parks, thanked the members and SCAG staff for the development of the Plan and she expressed support for the Plan. She asked to make a correction on page 2 of the Appendix relating to Natural and Farm Lands that referenced the total land area designated for protection as 510,000 acres—which is the plan area—as not all of this land area is designated for protection. She asked that SCAG staff be directed to make this edit.

Richard Lambros, Southern California Leadership Council, expressed support for the Plan and complimented the members and SCAG staff for their efforts.

Marnie Primmer, Interim Executive Director, Orange County Council of Governments, expressed support for the Plan and echoed comments made with respect to the insertion of the language in Chapter IV, page 70, regarding protection for local jurisdictions for using subjurisdictional data. She complimented SCAG staff for addressing OCCOG’s concerns.

Chair Wapner closed the Public Comment period.

At 11:45 a.m., Chair Wapner announced that the Special Joint Meeting of the Policy Committees would recess and reconvene at 12:00 p.m.

At 12:00 p.m., Chair Wapner reconvened the Special Joint Meeting of the Policy Committees.

## 2. Proposed Final 2016-20140 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (2016 RTP/SCS) Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR)

EEC Chair Deborah Robertson introduced the item and asked Huasha Liu, Director, Land Use and Environmental Planning, to provide background information. Ms. Liu stated the Proposed Final PEIR was prepared pursuant to CEQA and analyzes the environmental effects of the Plan and includes mechanisms to mitigate the significant environmental effects per CEQA guidelines. She also stated that the PEIR must be certified by the Regional Council prior to any action to approve the Plan. Ms. Liu reported that the PEIR is a legally-defensible document that meets CEQA requirements. She discussed the outreach process; timeline of the release of the PEIR; and the five (5) major components of the PEIR. Lastly, Ms. Liu discussed looking ahead beyond the PEIR to help local jurisdictions reduce the burden for CEQA work in fulfilling SCAG's mitigation measures and by facilitating any CEQA reviews associated with Plan amendments. Lastly, Ms. Liu announced the upcoming schedule for the proposed certification of the PEIR and adoption of the Plan at the April 7, 2016 of the Regional Council; and the need for reviewing agencies to approve the Plan with respect to air quality conformity by June, 2016.

EEC Chair Deborah Robertson, Rialto, asked that a correction be made on pages 54 and 101 of the Plan, with respect to the 10 Freeway Corridor and note for the record that that “freight/truck traffic does not disappear” as the trucks continue on the 15 Freeway and on to the 10 East Freeway.

TC Member Russell Betts, Desert Hot Springs, stated that based on his recollection, the Transportation Committee policy decision regarding a Mileage Based User Fee or a Vehicle Miles Travelled (VMT) fee, was SCAG would stay neutral and would not address specifically what this specific funding source. However, in reference to page 140, Councilmember Betts stated the Plan indicated \$5.5 billion for VMT funding between 2021–2025; and \$124.8 billion throughout the life of the Plan. He expressed concerns regarding the cited specific funding source as he considered any “VMT fee to be a huge mistake.” For this reason, Councilmember Betts stated he could not support the Plan without a change to the language to indicate support for an excise tax. Chair Wapner responded that such a change is not within SCAG's purview since it is the Legislature's responsibility to decide on a VMT fee or other funding mechanism. Hasan Ikhata, Executive Director, also provided a clarification and stated that as part of the Plan, all reasonably available new revenue sources including short-term adjustments to state and federal gas excise tax rates and long-term replacement of gas taxes with Mileage-Based User Fees, or other comparable sources that satisfy federal requirements. Furthermore, Chair Wapner stated that as recorded in the minutes of its September 2015 meeting, the Transportation Committee approved transportation funding guiding principles namely, *“to establish a user-based system that better reflects the true cost of transportation with firewall protection for transportation funds while ensuring an equitable distribution of costs and benefits.”*

CEHD Member Joseph McKee, Desert Hot Springs, expressed concerns regarding environmental justice, specifically, in the City of Desert Hot Springs. He cited an example of the first and last mile challenges faced by his constituents and the methodology of “forcing drivers out of their cars” while increasing the cost of cars, taxes, etc... Hasan Ikhata clarified that the goal is not to force drivers out of their cars, rather to provide alternative modes of transportation for people who do not want to drive.

TC Member Jonathan Curtis, La Cañada Flintridge, thanked Hasan Ikhata and SCAG staff for their professionalism and expertise in developing the Plan and the associated PEIR and he complimented staff on the public participation process. He also recognized the Policy Committee members' efforts in



reviewing documents and reaching out to their respective communities. As a Regional Council District 36 representative for the cities of La Cañada Flintridge, Pasadena and South Pasadena, he stated that he is focused on two (2) factors of the Plan: air quality and transportation goals as it relates to the 710 Tunnel's 4.5 miles long with no exits, cost to build is \$5.6 billion, and its associated health impacts.

A MOTION was made (TC Member Jonathan Curtis, La Cañada Flintridge) that *“the 710 (North Extension Project) be expressly excluded from the 2016 RTP/SCS without prejudice to being added back in a later time.”* Motion was SECONDED (TC Member Dan Medina, Gardena).

Hasan Ikhata provided background information and acknowledged inclusion of the 710 North Extension Project in the Plan's project list as submitted by Metro. He emphasized that there is no reference of a “tunnel” in the Plan although modeled as a capacity project. Mr. Ikhata recommended respecting the principles of local control. Chair Wapner recommended bringing this matter to the Metro Board.

Hasan Ikhata acknowledged and thanked the members for their comments and stated the requested minor changes to the Plan will be made. However, with regards to making major changes to the Plan, Mr. Ikhata cautioned the members and stated that *“maybe it seems like a simple thing to take a project that way we modeled but you will have to accept the delay in submitting the Plan because you have to go back and model the whole Plan and start a public comment period and you can do this—you can take the risk and delay the Plan—but it is not that simple to just changing the language.”*

TC Member Micheál O'Leary, Culver City, directed a question to Hasan Ikhata and asked if he were to testify at a hearing regarding the 710 North Extension Project or an expansion of LAX, would he be able to emphatically state that SCAG was not endorsing either or both projects by virtue of their inclusion in the Plan. Hasan Ikhata responded that he would testify in accordance with any action taken on the Plan by the Regional Council.

TC Member Barbara Messina, Alhambra, clarified that since 1996, the alternatives to the 710 North Extension Project matter have been evaluated by Metro, Caltrans, etc. and the mobility and air quality issues have been addressed. She stated that the 710 Tunnel is a financially-constrained project and emphasized the importance of the role of a regional body with solving regional issues.

EEC Member Margaret Clark, Rosemead, expressed concerns relating to the congestion and air quality impacts in her city with respect to the 710 issue.

A SUBSTITUTE MOTION (EEC Member Margaret Clark, Rosemead) was made to leave the existing 710 language in the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS. Motion was SECONDED (EEC Member Larry Forester, Signal Hill).

A Point of Order was raised (CEHD Member Barbara Kogerman, Laguna Hills) who stated that the substitute motion was the opposite of the main motion and therefore, is not an appropriate substitute motion. Chair Wapner accepted the Point of Order. Chief Counsel Joann Africa confirmed that the substitute motion was not in order and explained that the original motion was still on the table for discussion and action.

EEC Member Megan Sahli-Wells, Culver City, expressed concern with respect to taking a position on specific issues instead of supporting the Plan as a whole.

EEC Member Diana Mahmud, South Pasadena, expressed concern with building a 60-foot diameter tunnel under a city over the objections of the residents with respect to the 710 matter. She stated that the 710 Tunnel will never be built but will need other transportation solutions and recommended that SCAG employ a bottom-up approach for future RTPs and consider the elimination of the 710 North Extension Project in the Plan.

Chair Wapner asked the maker of the motion to restate the motion. A MOTION was made (Curtis) to add language to the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS specifically to eliminate the use of the “tunnel” as an alternative for the 710 North Project. The SECONDER of the motion (Medina) agreed to the motion.

The MOTION failed by the following votes:

**AYES:** Curtis, Friedman, Genis, Joe, Mahmud, Medina, Moore, Peterson and Talamantes (9).

**NOES:** Ashton, Austin, Becerra, Benoit, Berry, Betts, Brown, Buscaino, Carey, Choi, Chun, Clark, Cooper, Daniels, Eaton, Finlay, Forester, Franklin, Fuentes, Gazeley, Herrera, Hofbauer, Hyatt, Jahn, Kogerman, Lantz, Lara Lorimore, Manalo, McCallon, McEachron, McKee, Messina, Mitchell, Murray, Nagel, Navarro, O’Connor, O’Leary, Osborne, Pollock, Predmore, Real Sebastian, Ramirez, Robertson, Robinson, Sanchez, Santa Ines, Shevlin, Sibert, Spiegel, Viegas-Walker, Wapner, Williams and Wilson (55).

**ABSTAIN:** McLean, Millhouse, Munzing and Sternquist (4).

CEHD Member Steve Nagel, Fountain Valley, asked that corrections be applied in the Plan relating to Orange County’s comments on specific language changes and cited examples.

TC Member Karen Spiegel, Corona, asked for explanation with respect to the comment made regarding the LAX passenger capacity and the matter on VMT. Hasan Ikhata responded and provided clarification.

EEC Member Edward Wilson, Signal Hill, expressed support for the Plan and suggested to look into the future.

A MOTION was made (EEC Member Edward Wilson, Signal Hill) to recommend that the Regional Council approve and adopt the Proposed 2016-2040 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy, including the associated Consistency Amendment No. 15-12 to the 2015 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP), by adopting Resolution No. 16-578-2. Motion was SECONDED (CEHD Member Margaret Finlay, Duarte).

TC Member Marsha McLean, Santa Clarita, thanked SCAG staff for being receptive to the comments provided by the City of Santa Clarita and recommended alternate language changes relating to VMT, such as: “would be implemented” to “could be implemented” and “assumed” to “propose,” to better reflect the differing views of the members. Hasan Ikhata explained that certain language changes that refer to revenues and costs cannot be made if they are not definitive enough for the federal government.

After conferring with Chief Counsel Joann Africa, Chair Wapner stated that adding the proposed language changes as recommended by TC Member McLean would not be possible as with such changes, the Plan may not be approved by the federal government.

TC Member Pam O'Connor, Santa Monica, provided background information regarding the VMT fee and stated support for the Plan as the Plan will benefit the region as a whole.

CEHD Member Barbara Kogerman, Laguna Hills, commented regarding the VMT fee and recommended the inclusion of other possibilities or options for funding sources in the Plan, in lieu of the VMT fee.

A SUBSTITUTE MOTION was made (CEHD Member Larry McCallon, Highland) to add language to the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS that would require reviewing the Plan in six (6) months and ensure the Business Plan is included in the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with the California High Speed Rail Authority (CHSRA). Motion was SECONDED (TC Member Ryan McEachron, Victorville).

TC Member Cheryl Viegas-Walker, El Centro, expressed concerns regarding the substitute motion and recommended moving forward with the approval of the Proposed 2016 RTP/SCS and *“not tie our hands as to high-speed rail only and a six-month review.”* For this reason, Councilmember Viegas-Walker stated she could not support the substitute motion.

The SUBSTITUTE MOTION failed by the following votes:

**AYES:** Choi, Clark, Herrera, Hofbauer, Jahn, Lantz, McCallon, McEachron, Moore and Wapner (10).

**NOES:** Ashton, Austin, Becerra, Benoit, Berry, Betts, Brown, Buscaino, Carey, Chen, Chun, Curtis, Daniels, Eaton, Finlay, Forester, Franklin, Fuentes, Gazeley, Genis, Hyatt, Joe, Kogerman, Lara Lorimore, Mahmud, Manalo, McKee, Medina, Messina, Mitchell, Munzing, Nagel, Navarro, O'Connor, O'Leary, Osborne, Peterson, Real Sebastian, Ramirez, Robertson, Santa Ines, Shevlin, Sibert, Spiegel, Sternquist, Viegas-Walker, Williams and Wilson (49).

**ABSTAIN:** Friedman and Sanchez (2).

Chair Wapner asked if the maker of the motion (Wilson) and the seconder of the motion (Finlay) would accept including a recommendation to the Regional Council to certify the associated PEIR in the original motion. Councilmembers Wilson and Finlay accepted the change to the motion. Therefore, the MOTION is: Recommend that the Regional Council approve and adopt the 2016-2040 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (2016 RTP/SCS), including the associated Consistency Amendment No. 15-12 to the 2015 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP), by adopting Resolution No. 16-578-2; and recommend that the Regional Council certify the Final Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) for the 2016-2040 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (2016 RTP/SCS) and adopt Findings of Fact, a Statement of Overriding Considerations, and a Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program associated with the Final PEIR, by adopting Resolution No. 16-578-1.

The MOTION passed by the following votes:

**AYES:** Ashton, Becerra, Benoit, Brown, Buscaino, Carey, Chen, Choi, Chun, Clark, Daniels, Eaton, Finlay, Forester, Franklin, Fuentes, Gazeley, Genis, Herrera, Hofbauer, Hyatt, Jahn, Lantz, Lara, Lorimore, Manalo, McCallon, McEachron, McKee, Medina, Messina, Mitchell, Moore, Navarro, O’Connor, O’Leary, Osborn, Real Sebastian, Ramirez, Robertson, Sanchez, Santa Ines, Shevlin, Sibert, Spiegel, Sternquist, Viegas-Walker, Wapner, Williams and Wilson (50).

**NOES:** Austin, Berry, Betts, Curtis, Joe, Kogerman, Munzing, Nagel and Peterson (9).

**ABSTAIN:** Friedman and Mahmud (2).

**ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, Chair Alan Wapner adjourned the Joint Meeting of the Policy Committees at 1:14 p.m.