Section VIII SCAG's Response to Comments

SECTION VIII

SCAG'S RESPONSE TO COMMENTS

Table of Contents

Response to Comments Introduction Matrix of 2019 FTIP Comments with responses



At its July 9, 2018 meeting, the Executive Administration Committee authorized the release of the Draft 2019 FTIP for a 30-day public review and comment period. Public notices were posted in major newspapers throughout the region and on SCAG's website. Staff also held two public hearings in the month of July. The comment period ended on August 8, 2018. A total of 25 comments were received on the Draft 2019 FTIP, including comments from Caltrans, Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) staff, CTC staff, and members from the public. Comments received resulted in further modifications to project scope, completion years and project costs. All comments received are addressed in the matrix that follows.

It should be noted that there were approximately 240 emails from private citizens sent to SCAG staff during the comment period that did not specifically mention the 2019 FTIP but instead were related to the 241 Toll Road project. While not included in the matrix, SCAG staff acknowledges the receipt of these emails and has respectively collected and forwarded them to the Transportation Corridor Agency (TCA) for consideration and further action. SCAG relies on local transportation agencies to provide their project priorities, ensuring local review and local control. The local agencies are required to undertake a thorough and documented public participation process. For these reasons, SCAG finds that TCA would be the appropriate agency to address the concerns of these private citizens.



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
FTIP 19-01	July 15, 2018	Lara Carlin	Private Citizen	I am concerned, because the TCA has recently submitted draft plans to Cal Trans, and SCAG has listed the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan. Citizens of south orange county do NOT need or want another toll road running through South OC. The propose routes are horrible. The TCA has 6.4 Billion Dollars of Debt and has produced no viable traffic reduction results. The current toll roads were suppose to be payed off by now, but instead they continue to increase the price to ride on the toll roads. ENOUGH is ENOUGH!	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 23, 2018
FTIP 19-02	July 16, 2018	Robin Brandt	Private Citizen	Please take immediate action to remove all reference to extending SR241 from the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan. There is no need for this road. There is no desire for this road. There is no money for this road. My community has been resisting the extension of SR241 for years, but in the process it has become clear that the TCA will do anything to fight for its self-preservation, in the face of clear evidence that its day has long passed. As you may or may not be aware, there has been an effort for years to extend SR241 south to join I5. In spite of modest usage and horrifically bad finances (resulting in refinancing the original debt three times) the TCA insists on pushing this project forward, threatening homes, businesses and health in San Clemente and surrounding cities. There has been active community opposition, and support in the fight against from local politicians and candidates, but the project won't die. The attached article describes the situation today, other than the fact that the Assembly bill to merge the TCA into OCTA was defeated in committee by OC business interests, many of whom have incestuous relationships with the agency. This article is not unbiased— the main source, Dan Bane, is the attorney suing on behalf of San Clemente— but it links to some of the important documents and evidence arguing against this agency's activities.	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 23, 2018



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				https://www.ocweekly.com/toll-road-ed-will-oc-soon-be- forced-to-pay-for-yet-another-useless-toll-road/		
				Think of the TCA as the manufacturer of an outdated weapons system. The military has said they don't want or need it but politicians in the pocket of the manufacturers will fight tooth and nail to keep it in the bill. It's wasteful and wrong.		
				Please make sure that this project does NOT get inserted into planning documents where it does not belong!		
				Thank you,		
				Robin Brandt		
FTIP 19-03	July 16, 2018	Denise Schnarr	Private Citizen	Hello, I am a parent of a 16 year old son and a husband who had a stroke 3 years ago! I had to drain an account that we had for college to get my husband in special treatment that only the wealth would have. We work hard for what we have and will sell the house and use the profit to pay for college but now I am finding out homes are falling out of escrow because of the toll road. Enough of this just do your job and stop this! We are not all wealth people in San Clemente a lot of us worked hard for what we have. I understand the TCA has submitted the draft plans to Cal Trans and SCAG has listed the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan. The TCA has 6.4 Billion Dollars of Debt with No Results it's been 22 years since they have built anything yet they are collecting millions of tax dollars (DEVELOPMENT FEES)! Why haven't the bonds been paid down and the 73 free like it was promised. What have they done with all the fees collected? The only people that are pushing these ideas are the ones getting paid I hope you are not one of them.	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 23, 2018
				Please listen to the video of an Orange County Supervisor as		



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				he talks about how the TCA needs to go! https://youtu.be/zeMin_7bapQ Thank you for listening and I hope you are not one of the paid mouth pieces for the Dunn/ Pringle/ Chamberlin/Bartlett/TCA. I am sure a few of you are just hope those of you that are not take a stand and do right by the people. They seem to be a secret government and push what they want not what we need. Really sad Orange County is so corrupt and the tax payers have to be afraid of the government. Denise Schnarr Concerned parent and tax payer		
FTIP 19-04	July 16, 2018	Jeff Casaw	Private Citizen	Hello, Please vote no on the extension of the toll road through San Clemente. This extension, creates a double log jam with a proposed entrance just past the 405/highway 1 elbow. It would do nothing to alleviate traffic and only add to the existing problem. The TCA has proven that they cannot manage their budget or forecast traffic uptake properly. They are currently running 6.4 billion dollars in debt and are re-casting it further out because of lack of revenues. Enough is enough, no one uses the road, it will cut a community in two and pass over another high school. Cal Trans and SCAG have listed the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Planplease vote no. Best regards, Jeff	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 23, 2018



Comment		Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
FTIP 19-05	July 17, 2018	Carol Gomez	South Coast Air Quality Management District (AQMD)	Public Comment made at July 17, 2018 Public Hearing via video conference from SCAG Orange County Office Ms. Gomez wanted to question the 87 tons of NOx reduction. Wants to know how SCAG came up with and if the number are real.	Comment Noted. Please see the response in Comment ID FTIP 19-24 later in this table.	July 17, 2018
FTIP 19-06	July 17, 2018	Mark Baza, Executive Director	Imperial County Transportation Commission	Public Comment made at July 17, 2018 Public Hearing via video conference from SCAG Imperial County Office Mr. Baza expressed his appreciation for the opportunity to comment and Imperial County is satisfied with the draft submittal as it was developed in collaboration with SCAG team to complete and always meeting state and federal requirements.	Comment Noted	July 17, 2018
FTIP 19-07	July 17, 2018	Abhijit J. Bagde, P.E. Senior Transportati on Engineer Division of Transportati on Programmin g Office of Federal Trans. Mgmt. Program	Caltrans	Hello Pablo, Thank you very much for providing us an opportunity to review SCAG's Draft 2019 FTIP. Please include response to the comments below when submitting final 2019 FTIP to Caltrans. Let me know of any questions. Thank you. General Comments: 1. Update the project description reflecting the current guidelines for use of Toll Credits for STIP projects. See Section VII of the link for information. http://www.dot.ca.gov/hq/transprog/federal/fedfiles/res_p_ublications/2019-ftip-dev-guidance_032218.pdf 2. Please process an amendment to align the draft 2019 FTIP with the 2018 STIP. This FTIP amendment must be submitted to Caltrans by October 1, 2018. Financial Summary: 1. SHOPP funding (revenue/programmed) is not consistent with the approved funding posted at the link below. Please clarify.	Comment Noted, will be reflected in #19-01 Comment Noted, will be reflected in #19-01 Comment Noted, will be reflected in #19-01	July 17, 2018



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				http://www.dot.ca.gov/hq/transprog/federal/fedfiles/2019 -shopp-grp/2018shopp_grppjt.html		_
				2. Highway Maintenance Program (HM): Include funding per the approved funding posted at the link below through Amendment No. 1. http://www.dot.ca.gov/hq/transprog/federal/fedfiles/various-pgms/hwy-mtc/hwy-mtc-program.htm	Comment Noted, will be reflected in #19-01	
				3. Highway Bridge Program: Per the approved project list below are the Revenue/Programming amounts. Please clarify the discrepancies. See link below for the approved project list. http://dot.ca.gov/hq/LocalPrograms/hbrr99/list-updated.html	Comment Noted, will be reflected in #19-01	
				FY 2018/19 - \$81,099,867 FY 2019/20 - \$87,812,984 FY2020/21 - \$71,638,454 FY 2021/22 - \$89,890,192		
				3. FTA 5310 Program: Explain basis for Revenue/programming for FYs 19/20 through 2021/22 as projects are selected by the CTC on annual basis.	Please see responses below for specific LA or OC projects.	
				4. CMAQ: Update the revenue estimate per information posted at the link below. http://www.dot.ca.gov/hq/transprog/federal/cmaq/cmaq-4yr-revised-52218.pdf	Comment Noted, will be reflected in #19-01	
				5. STP: Revenue estimate for FY 2018/19 is not consistent with the approved estimates posted at the link below. Please clarify. http://www.dot.ca.gov/hq/transprog/federal/rstp/stbgp-4yr-1819-121217.pdf	Comment Noted, will be reflected in #19-01	
				6. Highway Infrastructure Program: Include the revenue posted at the link below through Amendment No. 1. http://www.dot.ca.gov/hq/transprog/federal/fedfiles/res_p_ublications/hip-2018.pdf	Comment Noted, will be reflected in #19-01	
				7. HSIP: Revenue/Programming for FY 2018/19 is not consistent with the approved funding posted at the link below. Please clarify.	Comment Noted, will be reflected in #19-01	



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				http://www.dot.ca.gov/hq/transprog/federal/fedfiles/various_pgms/hsip_pgm/hsip_program.htm		
				Project Listings:		
				IMPL513: STIP funding programmed is not consistent with approved funding from the 2018 STIP.	Comment Noted. However, IMPL513 does not have STIP funding. Project 0515 will be updated in #19-01	
				2. LAOB951: Clarify for which funds the Toll Credits are being used.	Comment Noted, Project will be updated in #19-01	
				3. LAOD451: Update the RIP funding per 2018 STIP shown below	Project will be updated in #19-01	
				4. RIV170901: Per 2018 STIP RIP funding is programmed in FY 2022/23 as shown below. Please clarify.	Project will be updated in #19-01	
				5. SBD 20179701: SHOPP funding programmed is not consistent with the 2018 SHOPP as shown below. Please make corrections.	Project will be updated in #19-01	
				6. SBD34040: Include total project cost in the project description field.	Project will be updated in #19-01	
				7. LA0G104: Update funding per link below. http://dot.ca.gov/hq/LocalPrograms/hbrr99/2018/Mar/Line ltem Lists/2018 03 29 Dist07 LosAngelesCountyMetrLin eltem.pdf	Project will be updated in #19-01	
				8. Highway Bridge Program – Grouped projects for various counties – Update funding per approved project list. See Comment Number 3 under financial summary above.	Project will be updated in #19-01	
				9. SCAG015: Programming for FY 2018/19 is not consistent with the approved funding posted at the link below. Please clarify. http://www.dot.ca.gov/hq/transprog/federal/fedfiles/various-pgms/hsip-pgm/hsip-program.htm	Project will be updated in #19-01	
				10. LAOD198: Update funding per 2018 STIP.	Project will be updated in #19-01	



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				11. LA0G1123: What is the basis of programming FTA 5310 funding in FY 2019/20. 12. ORA080803: What is the basis of programming FTA 5310 funding in FY 2019/20 through FY 2021/22.	Response from the lead agency, Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority: Regarding 5310, the funds we receive and program are not allocated by the CTC. Metro is the Designated Recipient of 5310 funds apportioned to the Santa Clarita and Lancaster-Palmdale Urbanized Areas. Metro is also the Designated Recipient of 5310 funds allocated by SCAG to Los Angeles County from apportionments to the Los Angeles-Long Beach-Anaheim UZA. Response from the lead agency, Orange County Transportation Authority (Ben Ku): I talked to our finance people and they told me that CTC doesn't determine our 5310 info. They only do this for small UZA's. We used the rates out of the FTA apportionments to grow the funding through 2020 and then kept the numbers flat in FY20/21	
FTIP 19-08	July 17, 2018	Nancy	Los Angeles County	Hi Rongsheng –	and FY21/22. Ronsheng Luo:	
		Marroquin LA Metro Senior Transportati on Planning Manager, Federal/Stat e Policy & Programmin g	Metro	Metro would like to submit a comment through the public review process for the 2019 FTIP Adoption that concludes August 8, 2018 for project LA0G440. Metro is requesting that the Conformity Category be updated from TCM Committed to TCM. Per the conference call on 9/2/2015, it was agreed that the project would be TCM in 2017 FTIP. The Project became TCM Committed in 2019 FTIP as Metro did not remove the small amount in the ROW phase. Therefore, Metro will be removing the ROW funds and submitting the project with ENG phase funds only. Please allow Metro to update the conformity category to TCM from TCM Committed.	Hi Nancy, Yes, please proceed. Thanks LA0G440 will be corrected to be not a committed TCM in the final 2019 FTIP Project will be updated in the 2019 FTIP and 2019 FTIP Amendment #19-01	July 19, 2018



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
FTIP 19-09	July 17, 2018	Michelle Schumacher	Private Citizen	Good evening - We are in disbelief that SCAG included the ill found and improperly done TCA projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plans and that Cal Trans is wasting money on studying something that is flat out not needed and pure economic discrimination. Cal Trans is supposed to be based on public input and certainly not ECONOMICALLY DISCRIMINATING. The TCA has fabricated all support for this unwanted and unneeded project. TCA has not built anything in 20 years - the TCA owes more now and is so in debt the OC Grand Jury issued a solvency warning in 2015. The 73 toll road was supposed to be free 2 years ago. Instead a report said per mile they are 164 Million in debt per mile. That is not acceptable - nor an JPA that Cal Trans should be partnering with its failed past and lobbyist control. It is concerning to me what is going on with Cal Trans and the TCA. The TCA with the help of Cal Trans that sits on thier Board has essentially for over 1.5 years now conducted a massive operation of Opposition Suppression of residents in South Orange County. Between the civil rights that were violated at the TCA's June 5th public forum for over 2,500 people they tried to make sign the attached release to modify and manipulate statements which turned people away - disenfranchising and making thier voices not heard, please see the video below summarizing the undemocratic treatment at a public forum they invited the residents to, they have completely FAKED with the help of paid consultants for the lobbyist agenda any public input into the TCA proposed project for the economically discriminatory quest for managed toll lanes on the 5 freeway. Please let me know how it is OK for this agency to limit public comment to 2 minutes per person (video below in red). They did this last year after stacking the public meeting with thier lobbyists and consultants paid speakers and then cut out time down by 1 minute - 1 minute of our freedoms and democracy down away with.	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 23, 2018



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				The TCA has lied every step of the way to the Board of Directors, to tax payers and to agencies, such as the water board, that denied them the permit - now the TCA is trying to use a privately gained water permit and take over a free road from tax payers as the permits have been denied to them for the useless under used 241 extension. The TCA is an agency run amok and seriously the policies and practices need an investigation to protect tax payers from abuse and waste.		
				Cal Trans with the recent porn scandal, seems very similar to the pro Toll Road harassment we receive in the form of posts online such as this underage Russian girl - please see image below. With the cost of 5 million for the Cal Trans porn scandal you would think this type of behavior would have stopped. Instead it is the way to harass and belittle women in Orange County. Just so you know Cal Trans is NOT responding to public records requests.		
				Where are the checks and balances? The TCA is a JPA that behaves like the City of Bell and is not on the up and up. The TCA has been collecting Development Fees for 30 years - they have not built anything in 20 - why when they gave up the only route on the legislative maps still collecting these outrageous fees? Michael Kraman the CEO just received a retroactive 6% pay raise. This needs to stop.		
				Video June 5th Public Forum Civil Rights Violations - 1st & 4th Amendment Rights https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OmdFlIdlEF0		
				Video - One year ago that the TCA no longer allows 3 minutes to speak. https://www.facebook.com/NOTMYTOLLROAD/videos/278 797732682878/		
				I hope we can speak soon as this is very concerning, between the economic discrimination of Cal Trans in the support and pursuit of Managed Toll Lanes while aiding and wasting money on the TCA's plans that are FAR OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF THE JPA AGREEMENT, Residents have not		



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
ID	Date			voted to approve the managed lanes as an extra tax as the California constitution requires, the quashing of our rights and legitimate public input by the TCA for lobbyist gain and benefit and Lisa Bartlett's our Orange County 5th Supervisor's donors (she sits on the TCA Board), this has to stop. Her campaign manager received a fat contract from the TCA and as the TCA claimed they were doing public input actually bought the domain name against the toll road extension - see attached. It seems that several high state officials are also in on this and pulling strings to make it easier for this indebted agency to destroy our homes, neighborhoods, business, schools, churches, parks and designated open spaces, all the while while out right lying to the Board and to the Public. Ironically they have received donations from all the TCA's stakeholders. The TCA lists neighborhoods and residents last on the stakeholder list. Thank you for your time and I look forward to speaking to share what is going on regarding the fabricated public input and the outright ridiculousness of the TCA proposals - they conducted the traffic studies while the freeway was under construction. The numbers are garbage. They gave 2 years worth of baloney stating they were looking at 18 options when they only build toll roads and having nothing to do with rail and what the OCTA works on. Now the plans have narrowed to 8 toll roads - 5 of which include managed toll lanes on the 5 freeway. The TCA is NOT legally allowed to have anything to do with our public freeways - happy to provide the Joint Powers Agreement - they are Way off tract and this will not be let to stand. Tax payers deserve more. The City of San Clemente commissioned a study and it demonstrated what is clear to even a not smart person the Toll Road proposals will make traffic worse and cost a fortune. I look forward to speaking with you very soon.		of Receipt
				Michelle		



Comment	Comment Date	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement of Receipt
FTIP 19-10	July 22, 2018	Heather Arnwine	Private Citizen	Good Morning, My name is Heather Arnwine. I am a California Native, and currently live in San Clemente. The TCA has submitted the draft plans and has listed the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan and they should be stopped. The TCA has 6.4 Billion Dollars of Debt with No Results! These plans to cut through San Clemente will NOT help alleviate traffic, it will only make it worse. Their plans will destroy homes, schools and our community. Their managed lanes will also take out businesses and homes. Their study was based off traffic during construction on the 5 freeway that was just recently completed. Our feeways can not be widened any more and throwing a massive toll road straight through our town will not alleviate any traffic. I am urging you you please not accept these plans from the TCA! They need to pay back their debt and ultimately abolished. PleaseNO	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 23, 2018
FTIP 19-11	July 23, 2018	Tony Hays	Private Citizen	We are aware that the Transportation Corridor Agency (TCA) has submitted the draft plans to Cal Trans and SCAG has listed the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan with 8 projects 5 of them include managed toll lanes on the 5 freeway in conjunction with an unneeded toll road. The TCA has demonstrated unbelievably bad strategic planning by building sections of the Route 241 toll road without having first secured the right of way for completion of the route. Now they have made an agreement with a private party not to continue with the route that was originally intended. They are going to destroy the City of San Clemente to make up for their incompetence. Many families (and our family is one of them) chose to live in San Clemente because of the pristine open spaces for walking and enjoying the relative peace and quiet of open areas. Because of strict zoning requirements we paid a premium price for our home, but knowing that we were also buying access to these open areas. The TCA wants to take that away from us by providing "mitigation" in some other area distant from where we live. This is the process that might occur in China or some other totalitarian state, but not in the United States.	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 23, 2018



Comment	Comment Date	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement of Receipt
ID	Date			How would you feel if an elevated toll road were built right outside your backyard? Would you not feel that the government had let you down? - Tony Hays		or Receipt
FTIP 19-12	July 23, 2018	Masterplan Consulting Group, Inc.	Ellen McGuirk, owner	To Board of Directors of OCTA, Jessica, Matthew, Katerina, Lyndsay, Heather, Leslie, Adrian, Farid, Manny, Ted, Carrie, Tina: I am writing as a resident of San Clemente for the last 15 years. My husband has been a member of this community for over 31 years. We love this town and the wonderful views from most homes in this area. For the last year we have been reading about the TCA plan for a toll road through San Clemente to connect the 241 to San Diego. Why is this needed? Really? Most of the traffic congestion is gone because of the HOV lane that has opened on the I-5 freeway. Another toll road is not the answer!! The Toll Roads are extremely expensive! Most people in our town, and the surrounding areas do not want to pay \$8-15 dollars to save 10 minutes!! The TCA is over \$6 Billion dollars in debt and have not built anything in 20 years. That says that people are not using the toll roads and the organization is not well run! Despite dual taxation of property taxes, bail outs by government agencies and rising toll road rates, the TCA has not turned a profit or even broken even in 20 years! That means it is a flawed organization that is NOT contributing to the betterment of our transportation! The recent proposal to build a toll extension from Oso parkway through Cow Camp road and the "to the San Diego county line" is very misleading. The proposal is for 10.3 miles. How is that ACTUALLY going to happen? One way is through San Clemente and right by our high school, destroying ocean views, home values and bringing pollution and water run off problems, along with unstable land issues to San Clemente. The TCA has submitted the draft plans to Cal Trans and SCAG has listed the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan.	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 23, 2018
L	I.	l	I	ricase investigate and listen to the many residents and		



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				experts are saying about the devastation that would happen if this construction project would go through. Please reconsider and reject this proposal to build a toll road through San Clemente. This plan is seriously flawed and does not have ANY buy-in to the population that would use the road. This is really another construction project proposed, to help keep the TCA afloat for a few more years. The TCA is a flawed and bankrupt entity. Please no toll road in South Orange County. The TCA has 6.4 Billion Dollars of Debt with no results. Ellen Ellen McGuirk, owner Masterplan Consulting Group, Inc.		
FTIP 19-13	July 23, 2018	Bob Anderson	Sherman Oaks Homeowners Association (SOHA)	Southern California Association of Governments Attention: Pablo Gutierrez 900 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1700 Los Angeles, CA 90017 gutierre@scag.ca.gov Subject: SOHA Comments on SCAG Draft FTIP Dear Mr. Gutierrez, The Sherman Oaks Homeowners Association has reviewed the relevant sections of SCAG's Draft 2019 Federal Transportation Improvement Program. At the current time, our primary focus is on Phase II of Metro's Sepulveda Transit Corridor Project – the tunnel through the Pass from the San Fernando Valley to the Westside. Essentially the entire Valley section of the project is located in our Sherman Oaks community, so we have been monitoring this project closely. We just submitted the attached letter to Metro with 41 comments on the Sepulveda Transit Corridor Project and submit them to SCAG as we feel they are also very relevant to the draft FTIP. This project addresses one of the major north-south transit corridors in Los Angeles County. Thank you. If you have questions or would like to discuss our comments, please contact me at BobHillsideOrdinance@roadrunner.com or 213-364-7470.	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 23, 2018



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date			Sincerely, Bob Anderson Chair, Transportation Committee Board Member Sherman Oaks Homeowners Association		of Receipt
FTIP 19-14	July 23, 2018	Ghada Ghantous	Private Citizen	I read recently that the Transportation Corridor Agency, an agency that was created to build toll roads, has submitted a 1,200+ page draft plan to Cal Trans and SCAG listing the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan. There are 8 options, 5 of which include managed toll lanes on the 5 freeway. Several of the options go through existing neighborhoods in San Clemente, in addition to adding toll lanes to both sides of the 5 freeway from Pico to Basilone. If approved, the proposed plans will result in a total of 12 lanes on the 5 fwy! The TCA has the power of eminent domain, and in order to add the toll lanes to the I-5, homes/ businesses/ open space will have to be taken along either side of the freeway. The proposed plans set aside millions of dollars for "taking/purchase" of 150 properties on either side of the 5 fwy from Pico to Basilone. Based on the drawings I have seen, possible impacted structures could include hotels, churches, grocery stores not to mention residents' homes. This is outrageous! As a tax payer, I would like to know why Cal Trans is working with the TCA and using OUR TAX Dollars to study proposals that are not on the legislative maps and are not voter approved?	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 23, 2018
				The TCA is a fiscally-irresponsilble agency which is \$6.4 billion in debt. With their record of failure, they are in no position to propose any new projects, especially ones that are not needed and will destroy existing neighborhoods.		



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				The 73 freeway was supposed to be free 2 years ago. Instead of paying down the bonds, the TCA continues to drown in debt while using its funds to give the CEO a 6% retroactive pay raise, sponsor tournaments and events and send its executives to overseas conferences. This is waste and abuse of tax payer money. Orange County transportation planning is the responsibility of OCTA and Cal Trans, NOT the TCA.		
				The TCA has collected development fees for 30 years from south OC Cities, yet they have build nothing in over 20 years. Why are they still collecting development fees? The agency fabricated both the public input and the studies that were conducted in the middle of the 5 freeway construction expansion. Why would they conduct traffic studies during construction when they know traffic will be adversely impacted? This agency is corrupt and is reaching far outside of its scope.		
				Instead of taking on more debt and building any new toll roads, it is time for the TCA to pay down the bonds. Please turn down the TCA's 8 proposals and leave Orange County's transportation planning in the hands of the OCTA and Cal Trans.		
				Thank you,		
				Ghada		
FTIP 19-15	July 26, 2018	Gary Gileno	Private Citizen	Public Comment made at July 26, 2018 Public Hearing at SCAG Los Angeles Office Ok. Good Afternoon. Good afternoon Southern California Shadow Government. So for 53 years this agency has been here and after all of these decades, still no one comes to these meetings. If you guys were in marketing you'd all be fired. So I've looked over these documents just a little bit, just to see what it is you guys are trying to do, and what I got out of it is there are projects that are going to cost more than originally anticipated and you're updating the pricing, some of them are going to take longer than anticipated, and	Comment noted. SCAG is required to demonstrate that the FTIP and RTP are fiscally constrained, meaning that there is sufficient funds (Federal, State, local and private) to implements projects. In addition, the projects in the FTIP and RTP must reflect the latest project cost estimates in order to receive federal funding approval.	July 26, 2018





Comment ID	Comment Date	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement of Receipt
				and put in toll roads everywhere if your goal is to get us out of our cars in the first place? I mean just everything that goes on around here in California is just a** backwards. We're living in a state where you can shoot up needles into your arm and do it basically legally, but if you use a straw in a restaurant, you can go to jail! It's the same thing here you want to widen the roads while trying to get us out of our cars. I think I've said enough for today, thank you.		
FTIP 19-16	July 26, 2018	Lorelle Moe- Luna Planning and Programmin g Manager	Riverside County Transportation Commission	Public Comment made at July 26, 2018 Public Hearing via video conference from SCAG Riverside Office Yes, I would like to make a comment. Hi Pablo, this is Lorelle Luna with RCTC, we just wanted to say thank you to you and Agustin and to Daniel and to the SCAG Staff for getting us through the RTP Amendment here. It was a big undertaking for not just us, but for all of the agencies in Riverside County who had changes. And all of you work so hard with us and everything went pretty smoothly and the staff there was just very responsive to all of our questions and needs, so we want to thank you very much for all of your hard work on this.	Comment Noted	July 26, 2018
FTIP 19-17	July 27, 2018	Parker Wondries	Private Citizen	We respectfully and forcefully OBJECT to the 241 Toll rd Extension at OSO as proposed by TCA. We understand that draft plans have been submitted to Cal Trans and SCAG for 2019 Federal Transportation Plan Projects. We feel the widening of the 5 freeway in South Orange County as well as the extension of La Pata are more than sufficient additions to help alleviate traffic in South OC. WE DO NOT WANT THE 241 TOLL ROAD EXTENSION TO GO THROUGH. WE URGE YOU TO HEAR US AND HELP US PUT AN END TO THIS TOLL ROAD NIGHTMARE THAT CONTINUES TO WASTE TIME ANS RESOURCES. ASSIST IN DISMANTLING THE TCA. Parker Wondries and residents in our neighborhood oppose the 241 TOLL ROAD Extension. San Clemente Ca	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	August 22, 2018



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
FTIP 19-18	July 27, 2018	Fabia Barsic	Private Citizen	Attention - URGENT The TCA has submitted the draft plans to Cal Trans, and SCAG has listed the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan. PLEASE STOP THIS INSANITY of the building a TOLL ROAD THAT CUTS RIGHT THROUGH OUR COMMUNITY IN SAN CLEMENTE. Please stop any toll road in South OC. The TCA has 6.4 Billion Dollars of Debt with No Results. For the love of God, please put an end to the idea of a 241 toll road extension. It is not needed and it will devastate well established communities! Fabia Barsic	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 27, 2018
FTIP 19-19	July 29, 2018	Michelle Schumacher	Private Citizen	Good afternoon, We are aware that the Transportation Corridor Agency (TCA) has submitted the draft plans to Cal Trans and SCAG has listed the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan with 8 projects 5 of them include managed toll lanes on the 5 freeway in conjunction with a devastating unmitigatable not needed toll road. The TCA has 6.4 Billion Dollars of Debt with No Results. Why in the world are our beautiful historic cities being put on a chopping block for urban sprawl by an agency with a 30 year track record of abysmal failure? Why in the world is CAL TRANS using OUR TAX Dollars studying proposals that are not on the legislative maps and are not voter approved for use of the extra toll tax on our freeways? New taxes need a vote of citizens in California pursuant to	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	August 8, 2018



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date				_	of Receipt
				our California Constitution. Cal Trans should not be abusing tax payers by working with the TCA on economically discriminatory projects of managed toll lanes on the 5 freeway when Managed Lanes as a new tax that HAVE NOT been approved by tax payers of our SB funds?		
				Recent studies show clearly the TCA's proposals will make traffic worse. In addition the price tag is too hefty so a few drivers can enjoy a congestion free alternative as the toll roads boast on thier website. They TCA is actually proud of the fact the toll roads are underused. The 73 was supposed to be free 2 years ago instead the TCA owes 6.4 BILLION dollars more than the cost to construct the toll roads over 20 years later - this is going in the wrong direction. The CEO was just awarded a 6% retroactive pay raise. The top employees use the TCA and the money that should go to pay down the bonds for international travel and sponsoring golf tournaments and on and on the waste and abuse of tax payers.		
				The TCA has collected development fees for 30 years from our South OC Cities, they gave up the only route on the legislative maps in 2016 - why are they still collecting development fees? The TCA is trying to morph into something that is OUTSIDE the scope of the Joint Powers Agreement - this is not only illegal but it is being rushed through by lobbyists and special interests. We already have the OCTA and Cal Trans our planning transportation agencies. The TCA has used OC as a piggy bank for 30 years they should NOT be looking into regional solutions.		
				The TCA has fabricated both the public input and the studies were conducted in the middle of the 5 freeway construction expansion - they dont care - the TCA lies to Board of Directors regularly and to residents often. The Mobility Plans they have said they were spending millions to look into for the past 2 years did not even include managed toll lanes on the 5 freeway until 2 months agothis agency is corrupt and is reaching far outside of its scope. We are asking for a FEDERAL INVESTIGATION and		
				prosecution - they are behaving the same way as the City of		



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				Bell as a horizontal JPA we believe - there are NO checks and balances. Please throw these submissions from the TCA in the trash where they belong. Cal Trans has no business being economically discriminatory and SCAG - your organization believes in public input - the TCA is lobbyists lead and this is special interest nonsense that will harm all of OC for years to come.		
				It is time the TCA does one thing and pay down the bonds, they have been hoarding cash with the last refinance several references - to appear cash flush and not the risky nightmare they have proven to be time and time again. Please note that TAX PAYERS have not forgotten the last time this agency used 1.1 Billion Dollars for a tax payer bailout. Thank you and should you wish for any back up up any of the items referenced in this email please do not hesitate to contact me. Michelle S		
FTIP 19-20	July 30, 2018	Julian Husbands	Private Citizen	Good Morning, I read recently that the Transportation Corridor Agency, an agency that was created to build toll roads, has submitted a 1,200+ page draft plan to Cal Trans and SCAG listing the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan. There are 8 options, 5 of which include managed toll lanes on the 5 freeway. Several of the options go through existing neighborhoods in San Clemente, in addition to adding toll lanes to both sides of the 5 freeway from Pico to Basilone. If approved, the proposed plans will result in a total of 12 lanes on the Interstate 5. The TCA has the power of eminent domain, and in order to add the toll lanes to the I-5, homes/ businesses/ open space will have to be taken along either side of the freeway. The proposed plans set aside millions of dollars for "taking/ purchase" of 150 properties on either side of the 5 fwy from Pico to Basilone. Based on the drawings I have seen, possible impacted structures could include hotels, churches,	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	July 31, 2018



grocery stores not to mention residents' homes. This is outrageous! As a tax payer, I would like to know why Cal Trans is working with the TCA and using OUR TAX Dollars to study proposals that are not on the legislative maps and are not voter approved? The TCA is a fiscally-irresponsible agency which is \$6.4 billion in debt. With their record of failure, they are in no position to propose any new projects, especially ones that are not needed and will destroy existing neighborhoods. The 73 freeway was supposed to be free 2 years ago. Instead of paying down bonds, the TCA continues to drown in debt while using its funds to give the CEO a 6% retroactive pay raise, post rournaments and events and send its executives pay raise, post rournaments and events and send its executives to overseas conferences. This is waste and abuse of tax payer money. Orange County transportation planning is the responsibility of OCTA and Cal Trans, NOT the TCA. The TCA has collected development fees for 30 years from south OC Cities, yet they have build nothing in over 20 years. Why are they still cottening development fees? The agency fabricated both the public input and the studies that were conducted in the middle of the 5 freewor construction exponsion. Why would they conduct traffic studies during construction when they know traffic will be adversely impacted? This agency is corrupt and is reaching far outside	Comment	Comment N	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
outrageous! As a tax payer, I would like to know why Cal Trans is working with the TCA and using OUR TAX Dollars to study proposals that are not on the legislative maps and are not voter approved? The TCA is a fiscally-irresponsible agency which is \$6.4 billion in debt. With their record of failure, they are in no position to propose any new projects, especially ones that are not needed and will destroy existing neighborhoods. The 73 freeway was supposed to be free 2 years ago. Instead of paying down the bonds, the TCA continues to drown in debt while using its funds to give the CEO a 6% retroactive pay raise, sponsor tournaments and events and send its executives to overseas conferences. This is waste and abuse of tax payer money. Orange County transportation planning is the responsibility of OCTA and Cal Trans, NOT the TCA. The TCA has collected development fees for 30 years from south OC Cities, yet they have build nothing in over 20 years. Why are they still collecting development fees? The agency about the public input and the studies that were conducted in the middle of the 5 freewow construction expansion. Why would they conduct traffic studies during construction heat they have build nothing in core studies grantly and the public right and the studies that were conducted in the middle of the 5 freewow construction expansion. Why would they conduct traffic studies during construction heat they have build only adversely	ID	Date					of Receipt
with the TCA and using OUR TAX Dollars to study proposals that are not on the legislative maps and are not voter approved? The TCA is a fiscally-irresponsilble agency which is \$6.4 billion in debt. With their record of failure, they are in no position to propose any new projects, especially ones that are not needed and will destroy existing neighborhoods. The 73 freeway was supposed to be free 2 years ago. Instead of paying down the bonds, the TCA continues to drown in debt while using its funds to give the CEO a 6% retroactive pay raise, sponsor tournaments and events and send its executives to overseas conferences. This is waste and abuse of tax payer money. Orange County transportation planning is the responsibility of OCTA and Cal Trans, NOT the TCA. The TCA has collected development fees for 30 years from south OC Cities, yet they have build nothing in over 20 years. Why are they still collecting development fees? The agency fabricated both the public input and the studies that were conducted in the middle of the 5 freeway construction expansion. Why would they conduct traffic studies during construction when they know traffic will be adversely					9 ,		
of its scope. Instead of taking on more debt and building any new toll roads, it is time for the TCA to pay down the bonds. Please turn down the TCA's 8 proposals and leave Orange County's transportation planning in the hands of the OCTA and Cal Trans. I vociferously oppose a toll road that cuts through the heart of San Clemente. Sincerely, Julian Husbands					As a tax payer, I would like to know why Cal Trans is working with the TCA and using OUR TAX Dollars to study proposals that are not on the legislative maps and are not voter approved? The TCA is a fiscally-irresponsilble agency which is \$6.4 billion in debt. With their record of failure, they are in no position to propose any new projects, especially ones that are not needed and will destroy existing neighborhoods. The 73 freeway was supposed to be free 2 years ago. Instead of paying down the bonds, the TCA continues to drown in debt while using its funds to give the CEO a 6% retroactive pay raise, sponsor tournaments and events and send its executives to overseas conferences. This is waste and abuse of tax payer money. Orange County transportation planning is the responsibility of OCTA and Cal Trans, NOT the TCA. The TCA has collected development fees for 30 years from south OC Cities, yet they have build nothing in over 20 years. Why are they still collecting development fees? The agency fabricated both the public input and the studies that were conducted in the middle of the 5 freeway construction expansion. Why would they conduct traffic studies during construction when they know traffic will be adversely impacted? This agency is corrupt and is reaching far outside of its scope. Instead of taking on more debt and building any new toll roads, it is time for the TCA to pay down the bonds. Please turn down the TCA's 8 proposals and leave Orange County's transportation planning in the hands of the OCTA and Cal Trans. I vociferously oppose a toll road that cuts through the heart of San Clemente.		



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
FTIP 19-21	August 1, 2018	Stacey Arthur	Private Citizen	I read recently that the Transportation Corridor Agency, an agency that was created to build toll roads, has submitted a 1,200+ page draft plan to Cal Trans and SCAG listing the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan. There are 8 options, 5 of which include managed toll lanes on the 5 freeway. Several of the options go through existing neighborhoods in San Clemente, in addition to adding toll lanes to both sides of the 5 freeway from Pico to Basilone. If approved, the proposed plans will result in a total of 12 lanes on the 5 fwy! The TCA has the power of eminent domain, and in order to add the toll lanes to the I-5, homes/ businesses/ open space will have to be taken along either side of the freeway. The proposed plans set aside millions of dollars for "taking/ purchase" of 150 properties on either side of the 5 fwy from Pico to Basilone. Based on the drawings I have seen, possible impacted structures could include hotels, churches, grocery stores not to mention residents' homes. This is outrageous! As a tax payer, I would like to know why Cal Trans is working with the TCA and using OUR TAX Dollars to study proposals that are not on the legislative maps and are not voter approved? The TCA is a fiscally-irresponsilble agency which is \$6.4 billion in debt. With their record of failure, they are in no position to propose any new projects, especially ones that are not needed and will destroy existing neighborhoods. The 73 freeway was supposed to be free 2 years ago.	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	August 2, 2018



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date			Instead of paying down the bonds, the TCA continues to drown in debt while using its funds to give the CEO a 6% retroactive pay raise, sponsor tournaments and events and send its executives to overseas conferences. This is waste and abuse of tax payer money. Orange County transportation planning is the responsibility of OCTA and Cal Trans, NOT the TCA.		of Receipt
				The TCA has collected development fees for 30 years from south OC Cities, yet they have build nothing in over 20 years. Why are they still collecting development fees? The agency fabricated both the public input and the studies that were conducted in the middle of the 5 freeway construction expansion. Why would they conduct traffic studies during construction when they know traffic will be adversely impacted? This agency is corrupt and is reaching far outside of its scope. Instead of taking on more debt and building any new toll roads, it is time for the TCA to pay down the bonds. Please turn down the TCA's 8 proposals and leave Orange County's transportation planning in the hands of the OCTA and Cal Trans.		
				Thank you, Stacey		
FTIP 19-22	August 2, 2018	Gail Collins	Private Citizen	To Whom it may concern. I understand that the TCA has submitted draft plans to Cal Trans and SCAG, listing their projects for the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan. I urge the powers that be to take a close look at the Transportation Corridor Agency and determine if they are event relevant at this point in time.	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project	August 3, 2018



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				You'r sincere response is appreciated in San Clemente. The voters are watching. Sincerely yours Gail Collins	definition efforts. There are no right of way or construction funds programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	
FTIP 19-23	August 3, 2018	Tressy Capps	Private Citizen	Please confirm receipt of this email: I attended the public hearing in person at the SCAG LA Office July 26, 2018. The attached letter (which I demand be made part of my official comment and included on the record) is a record of my visit to your new offices. The high security at the Wilshire Grand only serves to discourage the public from engaging in the planning process. Requiring the public to produce identification to attend a public hearing in my opinion is a violation of the Brown Act and moving forward checks and balances need to be put in place to make sure this never happens again. For example, on the date you expect the public you notify the lobby personnel with signage or a flyer downstairs so there is no confusion whatsoever. Having followed SCAG's practices for several years I must say, you are either inept at public outreach or purposely covert. Perhaps one of your many taxpayer funded conferences can include Brown Act instruction and training for all SCAG staff. SCAG uses public funds to develop their plans but discourages public participation which should be investigated and remedied immediately. Sincerely, Tressy Capps From Attachment: From: Tressy Capps To: Los Angeles County District Attorney Public Integrity Unit Re: Possible Brown Act Violation 7-26-18 at SCAG LA Office	Comment noted and confirmation was provided. SCAG investigated the matter with the security office at the 900 Wilshire building and determined that there was a protocol error with respect to the July 26, 2018 public hearing. SCAG is working with building security to clarify the appropriate process for the public's attendance at SCAG public meetings and hearings.	August 3, 2018



Comment		Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				On the afternoon of July 26, 2018 while attending a public hearing at the SCAG LA office (see attached) security in the lobby required both me and Gary Gileno to produce our driver's licenses before we could proceed up the elevator. The woman at the counter called upstairs to SCAG, announced our presence, requested our ID and swiped our driver's licenses before we could go upstairs. I am requesting your office investigate this as there are many public meetings held each month at the SCAG offices and the public should not be forced to provide ID to attend these meetings which are posted on SCAG's website. http://www.scag.ca.gov/committees/Pages/Current-Agendas.aspx Please let me know the outcome of your investigation. I would also like to know if our information was stored on their computers. Sincerely, Tressy Capps		
FTIP 19-24	August 7, 2018	Carol A. Gomez	Planning and Rules Manager South Coast Air Quality Management District	Hello Pablo, Attached are our comments to the FTIP. Please let me know if you have any questions. A hard copy of the attached is going out in the mail today. From Attachment: August 2, 2018 Mr. Pablo Gutierrez Acting Manager Southern California Association of Governments 900 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 1700 Los Angeles, CA 90017		August 7, 2018



Comment	Comment Date	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement of Receipt
ID	Date					of Receipt
				Dear Mr. Gutierrez:		
				Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments on the Draft 2019 Federal Transportation Improvement Program (FTIP) and Draft Amendment No. 3 to the 2016 Regional Transportation Plan / Sustainable Communities Strategy (20 16 RTP/SCS) prepared by the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG). The South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) applauds your agency's efforts to forge forward with the development and release of this document which will facilitate the timely implementation of many important Transportation Control Measures (TCMs). We are committed to partnering with SCAG to meet the Plan's overall objectives.	Response to comment#1 (from next page) - As correctly noted by the commenter, the 87 tons per day of NOx emission reductions was calculated for the whole SCAG region between 2016 and 2020. The estimated NOx reductions and travel time saving were quantified with the same input/assumptions and methodology used for the Regional Emissions Analysis which are described in details in Section II. Regional Emissions Analysis of the	
				Similar to the policies and programs included in the 20 16 Air Quality Management Plan (AQMP) for the South Coast Air Basin (Basin), which was recently approved as part of the State Implementation Plan (SIP) for	2019 FTIP Technical Appendix – Volume II of III (pages II-1 through II- 40). It is important to note that the total regional emission reduction and travel time saving are not	
				California, we also anticipate that the transportation policies, projects, and programs included in the Draft 2019 FTIP and the Draft Amendment No.3 to the 2016 RTP/SCS will be critical components of the region's	required by nor part of the Regional Emissions Analysis for transportation conformity determination purposes; They are	
				collaborative advancement towards our mutual goals for clean air, mobility and efficient land use. Improved land use and transportation policies are also critical components to the success of California's climate change initiatives.	included in the Executive Summary to illustrate/highlight the benefits of 2019 FTIP; In addition, the 2019 FTIP, as stated immediately above the three figures on the bottom of	
				As you know, the health impacts of air pollution on residents in the Basin arc staggering. Exceedance of the federal health-based standards leads to heightened risk of premature deaths, lost work days and reduced quality of life	page 10 of the Executive Summary, will "HELP ACHIEVE" 87 tons per day of nitrogen oxides from 2016 level. To be consistent, the second and	
				due to various cardiopulmonary illnesses. Thus, it is in this context, that we submit the following comments to the Draft 2019 FTIP and the Draft Amendment No. 3 to the 2016 RTP/SCS, primarily focusing on air quality-related	third sentences of the last paragraph on page 10 of the Executive Summary will be combined and revised as follows:	
				transportation issues. Our comments below significantly focus on the achievement of air quality and transportation goals while addressing issues associated with the quantification of estimated emission reductions, the timely	The original two sentences: "By 2020, the FTIP is projected to help the region to achieve a reduction of	
				implementation of Transportation Control Measures (TCMs), and the use of AB2766 funds for transportation	over 820,000 hours per day in travel time. This would result in a	



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date				_	of Receipt
				related projects within the SCAQMD's jurisdiction. Section II- Regional Emission Analysis:	reduction of 87 tons per day of nitrogen oxide (NOx), a pollutant which is emitted from cars, trucks and buses, among other sources."	
				Comment #1- The Executive Summary indicates that by	The combined/revised sentence: "By 2020, the FTIP is projected to help	
				2020, implementation of the FTIP will result in a decrease of 820,000 hrs/day from travel time on all automobile trips, which in return will result in a reduction of nitrogen oxides	the region to achieve a reduction of over 820,000 hours per day in travel time and a reduction of 87 tons per	
				(NOx) by 87 tons/day, based on 2016levels. Based on a review of Tables 21 through 48 in Section II- Regional Emissions Analysis, it is unclear how this NOx emission reduction level was quantified. Although the modeled	day of nitrogen oxide (NOx), a pollutant which is emitted from cars, trucks and buses, among other sources."	
				projects listed on pages 45-205 of the Regional Emission Analysis provide details on specific projects that will ultimately reduce travel time, no methodology is given of how the reduction in automobile travel time was calculated from the modeled projects. It can be assumed that the emission reductions were based from the modeled on-road NOx emissions difference	Since the 87 tons per day of NOx reduction will not be achieved by the 2019 FTIP alone and the main purpose of the 2019 FTIP document is to fulfill federal and state requirements, it is appropriate to	
				between 2016 and 2020 with the planned transportation projects completed. However, the methodology used should be clarified and explained thoroughly in the document.	only report the regional total in the document.	
				Additionally, the 87 tons/day of NOx emissions reductions is for the whole SCAG region. The portion of these estimated emission reductions that take place within the South Coast Air Basin (SCAB) should also be quantified in the document.		
				Comment #2- On page 11-15, Table 6, the estimated trip reductions from parking subsidies increases from 0.00 percent for years 2019 through 2030 to 0.61 percent in 2031, and 2.97 percent in 2040. This estimated increase is not explained or justified. The rationale for this estimated increase in trip reductions from parking subsidies should be described.	The assumption regarding parking subsidies comes from the adopted 2016 RTP/SCS project #7120006, which identifies \$4.5 billion for region-wide additional TDM investments. About half of this funding was assumed to incentivize	
					carpooling by subsidizing parking, resulting in the reduction of over 436,000 work trips per day, each year the program is in effect (2031- 2040). This is not a new project for	
					the 2019 FTIP, as it is included in the	



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
	Date				RTP/SCS adopted April 2016. Based on the assumptions that parking subsidies will start in 2031 and result in 436,436 work trips reduction for both 2035 and 2040, the percentages of parking subsidies for 2035 and 2040 are estimated first and then linearly extrapolated back to 2031 as follows: 1 - % of parking subsidies for 2035 = # work trip reduction/total Home-Based Work trips = 436,436/14,230,192 = 3.07% 2 - For 2040 = 436,436/14,673,471 = 2.97% 3 - For 2031 = 3.07%/5 = 0.61%	of Receipt
				Section III-: Timely Implementation of TCMs Comment #3- On page III-51, Project ID LAF9422 involves the procurement of seven 30-foot clean fuel vehicles to reduce headways on six selected DASH routes. It should be clarified what specific type of fuel is being used in the vehicles for this project. Comment #4- On page III-58, Project IDs ORA150602 and ORA 152203 involve the procurement of various small and medium expansion buses, as well as expansion minivans. It should be clarified what specific type of fuel is being used in the vehicles for these projects. Volume III- Project Listing Comment #5- For projects utilizing AB2766 funds, such as the following projects listed below, it should be	Response from LA Metro: CNG Response from OCTA: The Small and Medium Buses are Diesel. The Minivans are gasoline. Comment noted and addressed per individual projects below.	



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
				distinguished from which element of the program the funds are being derived from (e.g., MSRC).		
				Project ID LAOG719- The Willowbrook/Rosa Parks Transit Station Improvement Project	Response from LA Metro: MSRC	
				Project ID LAF7400- Monterey Park Clean Fuel Bus Replacements	Response from LA Metro: MSRC	
				Project ID LAOG433- Culver City Bus Replacement Project Project ID LAOG955- Culver City CNG Station Compressor Replacement Project	Response from LA Metro: The two projects have used AB2766 Subvention Funds, which are allocated to the City of Culver City based on population and utilized for capital projects such as the transit	
					bus replacement and the CNG station project.	
				Project ID RIV62029- Temecula Park-And-Ride Lot Development Project	Response from RCTC: <u>Subvention</u> <u>Funds</u>	
				Thank you again for the opportunity to comment on the Draft 2019 FTIP and Draft Amendment No. 3 to the 2016 RTP/SCS. The details covered in the documents and appendices reflect tremendous dedication to our regional planning process and to the continued improvement of air quality and mobility for the SCAG region.		
				Sincerely,		
				Sarah L. Rees, Ph.D. Assistant Deputy Executive Officer Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources		
FTIP 19-25	August 8, 2018	Devra Rossi	Private Citizen	Urgent Action item – The TCA has submitted the draft plans to Cal Trans and SCAG has listed the projects in the 2019 Federal Transportation Plan (both documents can be found at the links at the bottom). Email ASAP to the following people and tell them no toll road in South OC. The TCA has 6.4 Billion Dollars of Debt with No Results. You can share whatever you wish with them – short and sweet but please email ASAP	The FTIP is based on project submittals from local and regional agencies. SCAG cannot unilaterally delete or change projects that are contained in the FTIP unless inconsistent with the RTP. The FTC-South Project is depicted in the 2019 FTIP as a study with funding programmed for preliminary project definition efforts. There are no right	August 8, 2018



Comment	Comment	Name	Affiliation	Comment	Response	Acknowledgement
ID	Date					of Receipt
					programed for this study. SCAG has forwarded this comment to the lead agency, TCA, for their information.	

